

Voices from frontliners

by Mzl 10 Mzl 10

Submission date: 05-May-2023 08:22PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2085067839

File name: 12_Voices_from_the_Frontliners_Marzul_Hidayat.pdf (336.32K)

Word count: 7527

Character count: 43258

Research Article

Voices from the Frontliners: The Case of Motivations and Challenges of Mismatched Women Teachers in Public Secondary Schools

Harlina Harja¹, Amirul Mukminin², Muhaimin Muhaimin³, Marzul Hidayat⁴, Eddy Haryanto⁵, Siti Rahma Sari⁶, Fridiyanto Fridiyanto⁷

Abstract

Good teaching is obviously significant for education. There is no much definitive empirical evidence that motivational determinants of mismatched teachers keep teaching while they are also challenged by unintended consequences of being mismatched teachers. This case study sought to find out mismatched women teachers' motivations in public secondary schools. The data were collected mainly through semi-structured interviews. All interview data were recorded, transcribed, analyzed, and divided into themes. We followed the stages including: (a) preparing, engaging and immersing ourselves with the interview data, (b) creating preliminary codes, (c) seeking out for themes and sub-themes, (d) looking over or reviewing themes, (e) classifying and identifying themes. Our recursive analysis of the data helped us to conclude three major themes and several sub-themes including interpersonal factors: supportive colleagues and family, social service factors: obligation as educators, and challenges (content knowledge, the non-availability of teaching and learning materials, low salary but not feel dejected). Recommendations and implications are also discussed.

Keywords: Educational mismatch, interpersonal factors, mismatched women teachers, social service factors

¹ Lecturer, Dr., Institut Agama Islam Nusantara Batanghari, Fakultas Pendidikan Islam dan Keguruan, lina.harja@gmail.com, 0000-0002-3593-0377

² Prof. Dr., Universitas Jambi, Faculty of Education and Teacher Training, amirul.mukminin@unja.ac.id, 0000-0002-6806-1315

³ Prof. Dr., Universitas Jambi, Faculty of Education and Teacher Training, muhaimin_73@yahoo.de, 0000-0002-6269-5931

⁴ Assistant Prof. Dr., Universitas Jambi, Faculty of Education and Teacher Training, mhiday@yahoo.com, 0000-0002-7484-2396

⁵ Associate Prof. Dr., Universitas Jambi, Faculty of Education and Teacher Training, eharyanto@yahoo.com, 0000-0002-2393-4055

⁶ Lecturer, Dr. Institut Agama Islam Nusantara Batanghari, Fakultas Pendidikan Islam dan Keguruan, umirahma314@gmail.com, 0000-0001-7779-9429

⁷ Assistant Prof. Dr., UIN Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin Jambi, fridiyanto@uinjambi.ac.id, 0000-0002-5184-9587

Öncülerin Sesleri: Devlet Ortaokullarındaki Uyumsuz Kadın Öğretmenlerin Motivasyonları ve Zorlukları Örneği

Öz

İyi öğretim, eğitim için açıkça önemlidir. Uyumsuz öğretmenlerin motivasyonel belirleyicilerinin öğretmeye devam ederken, aynı zamanda uyumsuz öğretmen olmanın istenmeyen sonuçlarıyla karşı karşıya kaldıklarına dair çok kesin ampirik kanıt yoktur. Bu vaka çalışması, devlet ortaokullarında uyumsuz kadın öğretmenlerin motivasyonlarını bulmaya çalıştı. Veriler çoğunlukla yarı yapılandırılmış görüşmeler yoluyla toplanmıştır. Tüm görüşme verileri kaydedildi, yazıya döküldü, analiz edildi ve temalara bölündü. Aşağıdakileri içeren aşamaları takip ettik: (a) görüşme verileriyle kendimizi hazırlamak, dahil etmek ve bunlara dalmak, (b) ön kodlar oluşturmak, (c) temalar ve alt temalar aramak, (d) temalara bakmak veya gözden geçirmek, (e) temaları sınıflandırmak ve tanımlamak. Verilerin yinelenmeli analizimiz, kişilerarası faktörler dahil olmak üzere üç ana temayı ve birkaç alt temayı sonuçlandırmamıza yardımcı oldu: destekleyici meslektaşlar ve aile, sosyal hizmet faktörleri: eğitimci olarak yükümlülük ve zorluklar (içerik bilgisi, öğretim ve öğrenim materyallerinin bulunmaması , düşük maaş ama üzgün hissetmiyorum). Öneriler ve çıkarımlar da tartışılmıştır.

Anahtar Sözcükler: *Eğitim uyumsuzluğu, kişilerarası faktörler, uyumsuz kadın öğretmenler, sosyal hizmet faktörleri*

Introduction

It is no secret that today's schools need good teachers. The standard movement in education seems to use teacher quality and background and school quality as the two of the major contributions to educational attainment and student achievement (Azkiyah & Mukminin, 2017; Mukminin et al., 2019). However, dating back to the 1966 release of *Equality of Educational Opportunity*, the so-called the "Coleman Report" concluded that socioeconomic backgrounds (of students) were a considerably more influential factor to student performance. Additionally, according to Goldhaber (2002), teachers' qualities such as experience, education level, and certification status only contribute 3 percent of the differences to student achievement. "The remaining 97 percent of their contribution was associated with qualities or behaviors that could not be isolated and identified" (p. 3). Goldhaber (2002) keeps saying that though teacher experience as one of the two qualities (degree and education) is probably extensively investigated as it is easy to gauge, it seems to be only weak evidence that this characteristic consistently and positively controls student learning. Because "the statistically significant positive findings were found in only about 30 percent of the studies" (p.4). This seems to show that the contribution of teacher qualities to student performance is still indecisive and vague.

Another important issue in terms of teacher quality is teacher mismatch. Previous literature dealing with the effect of job-educational mismatch (education mismatch) has been documented (e.g., Allen & Weert, 2007; Allen & Velden, 2001; Carothers et al., 2019; Halim & Meerah, 2002). Skill mismatch explains the gap between the skills supplied and demanded in the society. Cedefop (2010) states that the term of mismatch refers to a person who is engaging in a job apart from the level or field of study. The large percentage of mismatched teachers who are not certified during the past decade has drawn attention to some researchers (Allen & Weert 2007; Allen & Velden, 2001; Carothers et al., 2019; Halim & Meerah, 2002; Medina, 2015; Mkandawire et al., 2016; Senarath & Patabendige, 2014). This phenomenon of "out-of-field teaching" has been postulated to be indicative of a teacher's inadequate subject-matter knowledge which results in a below-standard teaching quality (Darling-Hammond & Ball, 1997). In other words, it will lead to a problem in utilizing the skills that they acquire if they are educationally mismatched. Ironically, based on the recent data from

the Indonesian Ministry of Manpower (2017), 65% Indonesian people have experienced mismatch between their backgrounds and their jobs. Robst (1995) stated that job mismatch is influenced by the quality of the college they have graduated from. However, educational system in university has been geared toward the skills of development (Senarath, 2006). Universities are now seriously offering relevant teaching and learning based on the requirement skills needed in the society. Even so, educational mismatch still exists. Not surprisingly, mismatched teachers occur more often in small schools than in large schools (Ingersoll, 1999). This mismatch is believed to affect productivity, earnings, and work satisfaction.

Due to this disparity, Cedefop (2010) states that educated youth have to find a suitable job based on their qualification or accept any job without considering the qualifications or field of study. It has been observed that Indonesian educational system has been producing graduates that create a mismatch with the needs of the available jobs. This leads to a majority of educated workers with jobs unrelated to what they train for (Sicat, 2008). In previous studies, particularly in the developed countries, the researchers only focus on the effect of job-educational mismatch (education mismatch) (Allen & Weert, 2007; Allen & Velden, 2001; Carothers et al., 2019; Halim & Meerah, 2002; Mkandawire et al., 2016; Medina, 2015; Senarath & Patabendige, 2014). However, there is a limited study discussing about the motivations of these mismatched teachers to keep teaching in their schools. Furthermore, there is still a considerable level of attention that has not been given by the researchers on the dimension of education mismatch in Indonesia. This case study aimed to find out Indonesian mismatch teachers' motivations in secondary schools in Jambi, Indonesia focusing on women voices. To achieve the purpose of the study, one major question guided this study: What are the motivational determinants of mismatched women teachers in public secondary schools to keep teaching in their schools?

Literature Review

Educational Mismatch

There are two types of educational mismatch identified by the European Center for the Development of Vocational Training which are vertical and horizontal mismatches (Cedefop,

2010). Betti, Agostino, and Neri (2007) state that education mismatch refers to the lack of coherence between the required and offered educational level for a given job. Vertical mismatch occurs when the level of education that an individual is having is not suitable for the job. Further, vertical mismatch is divided into two types, over education and under education. Over education happens when one's educational background higher than the job required. On the contrary, under education exists when one's educational background lower than expected for the job. The second type of mismatch, horizontal mismatch, occurs when one's educational background as well as his/her skill is not appropriate for the job qualification. In short, a horizontal mismatched person does a job which is not related to his or her educational background (Robst, 2007). The case of horizontal mismatch is rarely found in the specific field of study which provides their students with specific skills in contrast to general degrees department in social sciences, humanities, arts, etc. (Robst, 2007). However, Kucel and Byrne (2008) suggest that the horizontal mismatch most likely happens because those from broader educational backgrounds are well-informed about their relevant jobs.

There are three logical reasons of vertical and horizontal mismatch that can happen. First, it is because there are limited skilled jobs in the society compared with a large number of skilled workers that exist (Green & McIntosh, 2007). In such situation, Green and McIntosh (2007) suggest to reduce the number of skilled or higher levels of educated youth to make it balance with the need of the society. Second, a logical reason for the existence of vertical and horizontal mismatch is limited information about labor market (Cedefop, 2010). Due to lack of jobs' information, the graduates could not find any suitable jobs related to their qualification which make them use their skills (Green & McIntosh, 2002). The last logical reason of the existence of vertical and horizontal mismatch is that the graduates' skills are heterogeneous with the existing education system. According to Green and McIntosh (2002), this situation makes the graduates consider themselves overeducated for the job in terms of formal or paper qualifications, but when their skills or abilities are concerned they may be suited for the current job.

Teaching Motivations

Motivation leads people to act in order to reach their goals and to make efforts toward their aims. Mifflin (1995) states that the word "motivation" is originated from the Latin word

movers, which mean to move. Thus, it is impossible to identify someone's motivations unless she/he behaves according to desire moves. Similarly, Robins and Coulter (2005) define motivation as willingness to exert high level of inspiration to reach organizational goals, conditioned by the efforts ability to satisfy some individual needs. Teacher motivation could have a major impact on student motivation as Dörnyei (2001) suggests that the most important factor that affects learners' motivations to learn depends on the level of their teachers' enthusiasm and commitment. Thus, teachers' motivation is one among the biggest contributors in optimizing teachers' performance (Filak, 2003). According to Lortie (1975), there were five important factors influencing teachers' motivations to keep teaching such as interpersonal, service, continuation, material benefit, and time compatibility. Interpersonal resources refer to the reasons for people to enter the teaching profession because it involves working and contacting with people, particularly young people in relation to the spread or diffusion of knowledge and skills (Lortie 1975). In short, interpersonal resources focus on the relationship or feeling of relatedness in teaching profession as teachers have to connect with their colleagues and students.

Service factors describe teaching as a respected service of a distinctive moral value (aura of its mission) (Lortie, 1975). People want to become teachers because they see the moral value of teaching. The third attractor is the continuation resource which describes the attachments to education and school, which makes people stay in school by becoming teachers (Lortie 1975). Under this factor, the reasons to be teachers because people want to take part to and continually contribute to educate other people. Material benefit factors exist when one is attracted to choose a teaching profession because of money, prestige, rewards, salaries, social mobility, and employment security (Lortie 1975). The last factor which motivates people to teach is the time and compatibility. People are attracted to enter the teaching profession for the reason that teaching provides compatible work schedules and calendars (Lortie 1975). By this reason, someone wants to be a teacher because he/she is able to arrange his/her time more freely than other occupations. In the purpose of this study, the researchers were guided by these five factors to explore mismatch teachers' motivations to keep teaching regardless having different educational backgrounds.

Methodology

This research was conducted in qualitative research with a case study approach to explore the perceptions and hidden motivations of mismatch teachers' to keep doing their jobs. Qualitative methods and case study were chosen in order to inform a complete understanding of research problems academically (Mukminin et al., 2015; Sulistiyo et al., 2017). According to Creswell (2007), qualitative research is carried out in a natural setting without manipulating the data. In this research, researchers focused on the participants' point of view, explored participants' experiences and finally provided rich narrative descriptions. Furthermore, a qualitative case study focuses on the issue of exploring one or extra cases in bound system (Creswell, 2007). In this research, the researchers focused on finding and exploring the motivations and challenges of mismatched teachers in Jambi, Indonesia, particularly on women voices.

Research Site and Participants

This study was conducted in different secondary schools in Jambi, Indonesia where mismatched women teachers taught. Before conducting the research in the schools, the researchers obtained the permission from the headmaster. Furthermore, participants' names involved in this research were pseudonyms in order to respect the participants' privacy. The participants were chosen using purposive sampling in the voluntary basis (Mukminin, Habibi, & Fridiyanto, 2020; Prasojo et al., 2018; Safitri et al., 2020). Merriam (1998) states that purposive sampling emphasizes on the selection criteria for the chosen participants in which the researchers can discover, understand, and gain more insight on crucial issues for the study. Thus, to gather the data and achieve the goal of this research, 8 mismatched women teachers were willing to get involved in this study. Their ages were between 27 and 38 years old with different teaching experiences as described in the following table.

Table 1
The demographic information of participants

Initial Names (Pseudonym)	Age	Teaching Experience (Years)	Majors (BA)	Current Teaching Subjects
MT 1	38	15	Accountancy	Art and Culture
MT 2	27	2	English Education	Culture and Tech
MT 3	32	7	Indonesian Literature	Vocational

MT 4	36	11	Science Education	Math and Tech
MT 5	27	2	Math Education	Vocational and Tech
MT 6	30	5	Chemistry Education	Art
MT 7	36	11	Biology Education	Civics
MT 8	27	2	Math Education	Industrial

Data collection and analysis

This research utilized a semi-structured interview as the primary instrument of data collection. The researchers used a semi-structured interview in order to get in-depth data or ideas from participants. Each interview sessions lasted for about 60-75 minutes for each participant to explore their motivations for being mismatched teachers. Each participant was interviewed more than three times which were based on their time and willingness. The interview sessions were carried out by using local language in order to give free spaces for the participants to explore their opinions, and the interviews were recorded with smartphone. For data analysis, the researchers transcribed all interview data with all participants manually. Thus, these activities took a lot of times. Then, transcripts were carefully read line by line, codified, and divided into themes to be presented. In addition, to establish the trustworthiness of the research or to verify the data accuracy, the researchers did member checking through sending back all the data to each participant. Patton (1990) states that member checking exists when all transcripts' data were given back to the participants that have been interviewed to make sure what they said were right. In this study, we followed the stages including: (a) preparing, engaging, and immersing ourselves with the interview data, (b) creating preliminary codes, (c) seeking out for themes and sub-themes, (d) looking over or reviewing themes, (e) classifying and identifying themes, (f) writing the final report. In the first stage, we adapted with the interview data by engaging ourselves with the transcription of data. As soon as the interview data were collected, the data were translated into English as the interview sessions were carried out by using local language. The next stage, we read line by line every text in order to code the data. The process of coding the data were begun with general and specific codes based on the research questions and literature review. Based on the general and specific codes, we analyzed every code in order to make final codes. Next, we used the final codes to craft major themes and sub-themes related to the research question. The established themes and sub-themes guided us to write our final report as presented and discussed in the following sections.

To deal with the credibility of the inquiry or the trustworthiness (Lincoln & Guba 1985) of our study, we took some steps. First, we did member checking (Creswell, 2007). In this step, we returned all of the interview data and our findings to all participants in order to get their feedback and agreement. This step was taken for making sure that our data were not bias. Second, we had prolonged engagement and repeated interviews with participants (Creswell 1997; Merriam 1998; Mukminin & McMahon, 2013). In this study, we interviewed each participant more than once lasted between 60 and 75 minutes. Additionally, we provided rich and thick descriptions (Merriam, 1998) and narratives of mismatched teachers.

Ethical Considerations

To protect the rights of human participants, the names of participants, places, and research site were masked through the use of pseudonyms. Participants' decision to take part in this study was entirely voluntary as they were provided with an informed consent form.

Findings

Our analysis of the interview data revealed three major themes and sub-themes that mainly motivated mismatched teachers to keep teaching irrelevant subjects with their educational backgrounds. We found three major themes and several sub-themes including interpersonal factors: supportive colleagues and family, social service factors: obligation as educators, and challenges (content knowledge, the non-availability of teaching and learning materials, low salary but not feel dejected).

Interpersonal Factors: Supportive Colleagues and Family

In this theme, our participants were asked about their interpersonal factors associated with their motivations to keep teaching as mismatch teachers in their school. Based on the interviews, most participants agreed that becoming mismatched teacher was not easy at the beginning. However, they were able to maintain their good motivations because of the support from both their colleagues and family.

"...so far there is no bad comment from my colleagues upon my mismatch subject. It is perhaps because the goals of the subject were achieved." (MT 1)

"...I never accept such a bad comment from my colleagues upon my mismatch subject. They are all welcome." (MT 2)

The data above indicated that as long as the participants achieved teaching goals, it would be fine for being mismatch teachers. Furthermore, all participants' colleagues were welcome to such a mismatch teacher phenomenon. In addition, teachers' job is not only teaching, but also making lesson plans. When it comes for mismatched teachers to write a lesson plan which is not their "truly" background or mismatch with their educational backgrounds, their colleagues were open-handedly to help the participants. Furthermore, the participants were also helped by the subject teachers' association team for creating a proper lesson plan.

"...For writing the lesson plan and some teaching stuffs, I am helped by senior teachers. But, I also try to find from some sources such as Google, and my friends in different schools." (MT 7)

"...when it comes to write a lesson plan, I and other teachers [within the same teaching subject] did some discussions to write and teach it properly." (MT 8)

Beside having supportive colleagues, it is undeniably that family support is also a significant factor which motivates the participants to keep teaching as mismatched teachers. The participants revealed that their family always supported what they did as long as it made them comfortable.

"...another factor makes me to keep teaching as mismatch teacher is my family. They always support me." (MT 3)

"...my husband always support me for 100% whatever subject that I teach, no matter it is based on my educational background or not as long as I am fine." (MT 6)

The data above indicated that the participants' motivations emerged due to the supportive and collaborative colleagues in the school as well as supportive family. By the help and support from both colleagues and family, the participants reported that they had good confidence in teaching different subjects from their educational backgrounds. However, the participants did hope that they can teach the subject which is relevant to their educational backgrounds.

Social Service Factors: Obligation as Educators

The finding demonstrated that mismatched teachers' motivations came from within. This situation was triggered by their educational backgrounds as educators. Even if they were assigned to teach different subjects from his/her educational backgrounds, the fact that, most of them graduated from education department. The data emerged consistently among the participants.

"...my primary motivation to keep teaching as a mismatched teacher is the fact that I graduated from education department. When this subject has been given to me [to teach], it becomes my obligation. Of course, I will teach it." (MT 4)

"In the beginning, it is hard for me to accept [teaching different subjects from educational backgrounds]. But because it is my choice to be a teacher, whatever subject is assigned to me by the school committee, I will accept." (MT 5)

"I will always teach [even as a mismatched teacher] because all my families are teachers and I also graduated from education department." (MT 3)

Not surprisingly, the primary motivation of the participants in this research was due to the similarity backgrounds as "educators". Furthermore, as educators, the participants believed that teaching is becoming their obligation. Even though it is challenging for them to become mismatched teachers, however, they could not stop teaching their students. It seemed that the participants were attached by teacher occupation. Furthermore, it would be fine for them to learn the new subject from the beginning as long as they still teach in the school.

"...I found it challenging for me, but I should not run away. I learn from senior teachers about the subject every day. Now, I get the knowledge [to teach different subjects] from my educational backgrounds, and I think if this is my obligation to teach the students." (MT 2)

"...then I think, this is a new challenge and new knowledge for me as a teacher." (MT 3)

"...then I said [to myself] I can do this. I can show to my students that I am qualified enough for this subject even I have to learn every day." (MT 7)

"...if you ask my motivation to teach different subjects than my educational background, I would say that it increase my knowledge about another subject. I have to learn from the beginning." (MT 4)

Interestingly, even though getting some difficulties to be mismatched teachers, the participants can handle the problems. They reported that they had to learn the teaching lesson

from the beginning to be familiar with the subject before teaching in the classroom. Most of the participants admitted that they did teaching preparation every night. Furthermore, the participants also reported that that even though they had different educational backgrounds from the subject they teach, they could handle it by learning from other teachers and other sources.

Challenges

Various challenges including content knowledge, teaching and learning materials, time management, and students' understanding were faced by mismatched women teachers. They were challenged by the fact that having a different educational background from what they were teaching was not easy to manage; however, they had high motivations to teach the subject.

Content knowledge, this sub-theme was one of the major challenges that our participants faced as mismatched women teachers. Our participants reported in the interview that they had lack of basic content knowledge regarding the subjects that they taught. With regard to this issue, participants reported,

"Due to the lack of basic content knowledge as my major in accounting and I teach the subject of environmental education, I have to have strong knowledge about environmental education and various methods and techniques of teaching. Sometimes, I used pictures and videos to attract my students' interest. Teaching environmental education is very difficult for me at first because I have no background about this." (MT1)

"You know my background is Chemistry Education, but I teach arts. It is not easy, sometimes it is very difficult to deliver the content. I feel disappointed with myself in teaching. But I have to teach them and keep encouraging myself in teaching." (MT6)

Based on the participants' accounts, they might be able to teach some aspects of environmental education, but not all aspects. Our participants considered their weaknesses in terms of content knowledge that should be delivered to their students in the classroom. We also found another thought-provoking issue as presented in the following sub-theme.

The non-availability of teaching and learning materials, our participants were surprised by the fact that the non-availability of teaching and learning resources was another challenging issue that led their teaching to be sometimes inefficient as expressed by participants,

“When I teach local content, I need some instruments to support my teaching process, but I do not have them.” (MT6)

“We have no enough teaching materials. It challenges me to teach the subject. So sometimes I am not able to give students all the information about the topic. (MT5)

When I was teaching Art and I need music instruments such guitar, drums, and others, but I did not find such kinds of instruments. Consequently, understanding the concept becomes very difficult for students rather than practices.” (MT3)

The non-availability of teaching and learning materials hindered our participants to teach their students. For them, the availability of teaching and learning materials such as books, art equipment would help them to teach their students although their educational background was different from what they taught. Limited access to up-to-date resources would attribute to reach the goals of the subject unsuccessfully. However, although our participants were challenged by the inadequate teaching materials, none of them resigned from the profession, indicating that they committed to the profession.

Low salary but not feel dejected, although all participants believed that salary was an important aspect to be a teacher, becoming mismatched women teachers led our participants to have a low salary. However, having a low salary did not lead them to feel dejected as they realized that their main reason to teach was to help students and schools as reported by our participants below.

“I think teaching and teaching my students at school is my primary reason. My school has limited teachers who can teach the subject that I have now. So, they hire me to teach although they know my background is not related to the subject. My school uses money from their operation funds to pay my salary.” (MT1).

“Salary is not my main motive to join my current school as I want to help my students. If you want to be a teacher in this current situation, you should accept whatever you will get.” (MT4)

“Before joining my current school, I was informed regarding the salary and I accept it and I want to help my school.” (MT8)

The transcripts of the interviews revealed that our participants enjoyed their profession despite their low-level salary from the school. Our participants' mission was to help their schools and students in achieving their educational purposes. For example, all participants voiced their main reason, "I want to help my school." The rest of our participants agreed that helping students and schools were important in their situation.

Discussion

The findings of this study are expected to be able to inform educators and policymakers on the motivational determinants of mismatched women teachers in public secondary schools to keep teaching in their schools. Our findings revealed what mismatched women teachers had (available skills) to teach and what their subjects were required. Motivational determinants and challenges of mismatched women teachers in public secondary schools were presented and interpreted from their perspectives. It was challenging to determine what motivational determinants led our participants to keep teaching in their schools and what challenges played a greater role than others as all seemed to be involvedly intertwined. However, the recursive analysis of the data led us to have three major themes and several sub-themes including interpersonal factors: supportive colleagues and family, social service factors: obligation as educators, challenges (content knowledge, the non-availability of teaching and learning materials, low salary but not feel dejected).

The finding of this study indicated that interpersonal factors: supportive colleagues and family contributed to keep our participants to teach the subjects offered to them although the subjects were not similar to their educational backgrounds. Lortie (1975) has written a study that cuts to the heart of the teaching profession found that one of the factors influencing teachers' motivations was interpersonal factors. Our participants reported that they obtained supports both from their colleagues and family. This finding showed that supportive colleagues and family were necessary for maintaining mismatched teachers in teaching. Supportive colleagues were needed when our participants to teach at school while supportive family was required to motivate them to keep teaching though their salary might not enough. We also found that social service factors: obligation as educators led our participants to stay as mismatched teachers as Lortie (1975) found social service factors as the reasons why people wanted to be teachers. Additionally, research done by Masbirorotni et al. (2020) found

that family support was one of the motives that influences someone who wants to be a teacher. Similar to our finding, Muazza et al. (2019) and Mukminin et al. (2019) found that interpersonal attractors were very important to keep teachers teaching. For our participants, even though it is challenging for them to become mismatched teachers, however, they could not stop teaching their students. It seemed that they were attached by teacher occupation. Furthermore, it would be fine for them to learn the new subject from the beginning as long as they still teach in the school. Participants in this study reported that their motivation emerged from their backgrounds as educators. The fact that, most of the participants in the current study graduated from education department. All participants shared their stories that even though they were assigned to teach different subjects than their qualification, it not a big problem, since the participants thought they were educators who had to be able to teach any subjects in the school. This suggested that they were able to manage their profession because they had supports socially and interpersonally, which facilitated them to keep having high motivations to teach.

In this study, we also found that content knowledge, the non-availability of teaching and learning materials, low salary but not feel dejected were challenges for our participants. For the content knowledge, our participants reported that they had to learn and prepare new things before teaching. This suggests that our participants with well-prepared teaching were able to teach their subjects well as Goldhaber (2002) stated that teachers' qualities such as experience, education level, and certification status only contribute 3 percent of the differences to student achievement. "The remaining 97 percent of their contribution was associated with qualities or behaviors that could not be isolated and identified "(p. 3). This finding is similar to what Syaiful et al. (2018) found that teacher candidates were encouraged to be teachers because they wanted to keep updating with their education and knowledge. Our participants in this study felt that although they had different educational backgrounds from what they taught, they wanted to learn something new and shared their knowledge to their students.

Moreover, in this study our finding also indicated that the non-availability of teaching and learning materials were another important challenge however these did not prevent them from teaching their subjects. The challenges related to the non-availability of teaching and learning materials are similar to the findings found by Habibi et al. (2018), Mukminin et al (2017),

Mukminin et al. (2017). They found that the non-availability of teaching and learning materials were the main issues in teaching and teachers should be able to manage these kinds of challenges. In our study, all of our participants reported those issues; however, they still had high motivations to teach regardless of the challenges.

Low salary was also one of our major issues in our study. Several previous studies indicated the same findings. For example, a study done by Mukminin et al. (2017) found that low salary was the main issue for every teacher in their study. Similarly, Killinc et al. (2012) proposed three reasons to be a teacher, "Teaching shall provide me a steady career path," "teaching shall enable me to have a reliable salary" while Kyriacou, Hultgren, and Stephens (1999), Yong (1995), and Lortie (1975) reported that salary/secure job was the initial motive to decide to choose a teacher as a career. Our participants reported that although they were challenged by the fact they had a low salary, they did not quit from their profession, indicating that even though many of the participants were not well paid by the school and the government because their status is not government employees yet, they were still doing their job with high motivations.

The findings of our qualitative study showed that the mismatched women teachers' motives for being a teacher were numerous; the types of motives on their career choice were likely to involve an interaction among interpersonal factors: supportive colleagues and family, social service factors: obligation as educators, and challenges (content knowledge, the non-availability of teaching and learning materials, low salary but not feel dejected) across participants qualitatively.

Conclusions

This case study sought to find out mismatched women teachers' motivations and challenges in public secondary schools. Our study wanted to seek why these mismatched women teachers kept teaching as we all realize that good teaching and teachers are vital for education; it's considerably less evident what makes for a good teacher. Hiring quality teachers in order to improve higher student achievement have been well studied around the world. However, there is little definitive empirical evidence, particularly in developing countries such as Indonesia that the motivational determinants of mismatched teachers keep

teaching while they are also challenged by unintended consequences of being mismatched teachers. Our recursive analysis of the data helped us to conclude three major themes and several sub-themes including interpersonal factors: supportive colleagues and family, social service factors: obligation as educators, challenges (content knowledge, the non-availability of teaching and learning materials, low salary but not feel dejected).

What do these empirical findings imply for policymaking? First, the importance of mismatched teacher quality cannot be underestimated, particularly their status and role in teaching. Policymakers should plan to have educational policies to improve their teaching skills by, for example, providing teacher training (e.g., short trainings or in-service trainings). Second, the existence of mismatched teachers cannot be ignored, particularly in developing countries that have teacher shortage. Instead of replacing them with qualified teachers, their presence should be appreciated by making programs that facilitating to have strong content knowledge on the subjects that they teach. Finally, policymakers should create the compensation structure for mismatched teachers.

Statements of Ethics and Conflict of Interest

"I, as the Corresponding Author, declare and undertake that in the study titled as "*Voices from the Frontliners: The Case of Motivations and Challenges of Mismatched Women Teachers in Public Secondary Schools*", scientific, ethical and citation rules were followed; Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry Journal Editorial Board has no responsibility for all ethical violations to be encountered, that all responsibility belongs to the author/s and that this study has not been sent to any other academic publication platform for evaluation."

References

- Allen, J., & Velden, R. van der Velden. (2001). Educational mismatch versus skill mismatches: Effect on wages, job satisfaction, and on the job search. *Oxford Economic Papers*, 3, 434-452.
- Allen, J., & Weert, E. (2007). What do educational mismatches tell us about skill mismatches? A cross-country analysis. *European Journal of Education*, 42(1), 59-73.

- Azkiyah, S. N., & Mukminin, A. (2017). In search of teaching quality of EFL student teachers through teaching practicum: Lessons from a teacher education program. [V iskanju kakovosti poučevanja prihodnjih učiteljev angleščine kot tujega jezika med pedagoško prakso: Program izobraževanja učiteljev] *Center for Educational Policy Studies Journal*, 7(4), 105-124.
- Betti, G., Agostino, A. D., & Neri, L. (2007). Education mismatch of graduates: A multidimensional and fuzzy approach. *Working Paper* 71.
- Carothers, D., Aydin, H., & Houdyshell, M. (2019). Teacher shortages and cultural mismatch: District and university collaboration for recruiting. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 10(3), 39-63.
- Cedefop (European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training). (2010). *The skill matching challenge: Analyzing skill mismatch and policy applications*. Publications Office of the European Union: Luxembourg.
- Coleman, J.S., Campbell, E.Q., Hobson, C.J., McPartland, F., Mood, A.M., Weinfeld, G.D., & York, R.L. (1966). *Equality of Educational Opportunity*. Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Darling-Hammond, L., & Ball, D. L. (1997). *What policymakers need to know and be able to do*. Prepared for the National Educational Goals Panel.
<http://www.negp.gov/NEGP/Reports/highstds.htm>.
- Dörnyei, Z. (2001). *Motivational strategies in the language classroom*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Filak, V., & Sheldon, K. (2003). Student psychological need satisfaction and college teacher-course evaluations. *Educational Psychology*, 23(3), 235-247. doi: 10.1080/0144341032000060084
- Goldhaber, D.D., & Brewer, D.J (1996). Evaluating the effect of teacher degree level on educational performance. Washington, DC: NCES.
- Green, F., & McIntosh, S. (2007). Is there a genuine under-utilization of skills amongs the over-qualified? *Applied Economics*, 39(4), 427-439.
- Green, F., & McIntosh, S. (2002). Is there a genuine under-utilization of skills amongst the overqualified?. *SKOPE Research Paper* 30.

- Habibi, A., Mukminin, A., Najwan, J., Sofwan, M., Haswindy, S., Marzulina, L., & Harto, K. (2018). Investigating EFL classroom management in pesantren: A case study. *Qualitative Report*, 23(9), 2105-2123.
- Halim, M., & Meerah, S. (2002). Science trainee teachers' pedagogical content knowledge and its influence on physics teaching. *Research in Science and Technological Education*, 20(2), 215-225.
- Ingersoll, R. M. (1999). The problem of under qualified teachers in american secondary schools." *Educational Researcher*, 28(2), 26-37. doi: 10.3102/0013189X028002026
- Kyriacou, C., Hulthgren, A., & Stephens, P. (1999). Student teachers' motivation to become asecondary school teacher in England and Norway. *Teacher Development*, 3(3), 373-381.
- Kucel, A., & Byrne, D. (2008). Are over-educated people insiders or outsiders? A case of job search methods and over education in the UK. *Dublin: ESRI – European Studies Research Institute (Working paper, No 258)*.
- Lortie, D. C. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological study*. London, UK: The University of Chicago Press.
- Masbirotroni, Mukminin, A., Muhaimin, Habibi, A., Haryanto, E., Hidayat, M., & Kamil, D. (2020). Why student teachers major in english education: An analysis of motives for becoming future teachers. [Zakaj se študenti pedagoških smeri odločajo za študij angleščine: Analiza motivov za odločitev postati učitelj] *Journal of Elementary Education*, 13(4), 429-451. doi:10.18690/rei.13.4.429-452.2020
- Medina, M. (2015). Gender and educational influences of job mismatch: the case of forestry and environmental science graduates of a Philippine State University. *Journal of Environmental and Occupational Science* , 4(1), 5-9.
- Merriam, S. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass.
- Mkandawire, M., Mwanjejele, J., Luo, Z., & Ruzagiriza, A. (2016). What mismatch challenges are there between what teacher education institutions teach and what is expected at work place? Retrospective views of secondary school teachers from Tanzania and Malawi Studying in China. *American Scientific Research Journal for Engineering, Technology, and Sciences (ASRJETS)*, 22(1), 39-49.
- Muazza, Mukminin, A., Rozanna, E. S., Harja, H., Habibi, A., Iqroni, D., . . . Nurulanningsih. (2019). Caring the silenced voices from an islamic boarding school-pesantren:

- Stories of volunteer teachers and policy implications. *Dirasat: Human and Social Sciences*, 46(3), 270-279.
- Mukminin, A., Kamil, D., Muazza, M., & Haryanto, E. (2017). Why teacher education? Documenting undocumented female student teachers' motives in Indonesia: A case study. *Qualitative Report*, 22(1), 309-326.
- Mukminin, A., Rohayati, T., Putra, H. A., Habibi, A., & Aina, M. (2017). The long walk to quality teacher education in indonesia: EFL student teachers' motives to become a teacher and policy implications. *Elementary Education Online*, 16(1), 35-59. doi:10.17051/ee.2017.16366.
- Mukminin, A., Masbirorotni, Marzulina, L., Erlina, D., Habibi, A., Fridiyanto, Nurulanningsih. (2019). Documenting undocumented motives influencing the career choice of the first-year science and math student teachers in indonesia. *Library Philosophy and Practice*, 2019.
- Mukminin, A., Habibi, A., & Fridiyanto. (2020). Technology in the classroom: Efl teachers' technological pedagogical and content knowledge. [Tehnologija U Razredu: Tehnološka Pedagoška I Sadržajna Znanja Učitelja Efl-A] *Informatologia*, 53(1-2), 24-36. doi:10.32914/i.53.1-2.3
- Mukminin, A., Habibi, A., Prasojo, L. D., Idi, A., & Hamidah, A. (2019). Curriculum reform in indonesia: Moving from an exclusive to inclusive curriculum. [Kurikularna prenova v Indoneziji: Prehod od izključujočega k vključujočemu kurikulumu] *Center for Educational Policy Studies Journal*, 9(2), 53-72.
- Mukminin, A., & McMahon, B. J. (2013). International graduate students' cross-cultural academic engagement: Stories of indonesian doctoral students on an american campus. *Qualitative Report*, 18(35).
- Mukminin, A., Ali, R. M., & Ashari, M. J. F. (2015). Voices from within: Student teachers' experiences in english academic writing socialization at one indonesian teacher training program. *Qualitative Report*, 20(9), 1394-1407.
- Patton, M. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Prasojo, L. D., Mukminin, A., Habibi, A., Marzulina, L., Sirozi, M., & Harto, K. (2018). Learning to teach in a digital age: ICT integration and EFL student teachers' teaching practices. *Teaching English with Technology*, 18(3), 18-32.
- Robst, J. (1995). College quality and over education. *Economic Educational Review*, 14(3), 221-8.

- Robst, J. (2007). Education and job match: The relatedness of college major and work. *Economics of Education Review*, 26(4), 703-717. doi: 10.1016/j.econedurev.2006.08.003.
- Safitri, N. T., Melati, Mukminin, A., & Hidayat, M. (2020). Exposing english teachers' pedagogical content knowledge: A case of english language teaching practises in indonesia. *International Journal of Scientific and Technology Research*, 9(3), 850-854.
- Senarath, S., & Patabendige, S. (2014). Job-education mismatch among the graduates: A Sri Lankan perspective. *Ruhuna Journal of Management and Finance*, 1(2), 1-16.
- Sicat, G. P. (2008). Unlimited and abundant labor supply: Econometric and other evidence in Philippine industry (No. 2008, 12). Discussion Paper//School of Economics, University of the Philippines.
- Syaiful, Mukminin, A., Masbirorotni, Aina, M., Habibi, A., Sari, S. R., & Triana, N. (2018). Preparing future teachers in indonesia: Motives of science and non-science student teachers for entering into teacher education programs. *Journal of Social Sciences Research*, 4(11), 354-363. doi:10.32861/jssr.411.354.363
- Sulistiyo, U., Mukminin, A., Abdurrahman, K., & Haryanto, E. (2017). Learning to teach: A case study of student teachers' practicum and policy recommendations. *Qualitative Report*, 22(3), 712-731.
- Yong, B. C. S. (1995). Teacher trainees' motive for entering into teaching career in Brunei Darussalam. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 11(3), 275-280.

Voices from frontliners

ORIGINALITY REPORT

17 %
SIMILARITY INDEX

14 %
INTERNET SOURCES

7 %
PUBLICATIONS

7 %
STUDENT PAPERS

MATCH ALL SOURCES (ONLY SELECTED SOURCE PRINTED)

5%
★ **www.tojqi.net**
Internet Source

Exclude quotes On
Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches Off